

“TELLING IT AS I SEE IT” - A CASE OF LIVING WITH THE CONSEQUENCES ALLEGATIONS OF RACISM WITHIN A PROFESSIONAL RUGBY UNION FRANCHISE

Chantelle Te Haara, Tahiri McLaren-Brown, John Davies

*Victoria Management School, Victoria University of Wellington
PO Box 600, Wellington, New Zealand; email: john.davies@vuw.ac.nz*

ABSTRACT

This case examines allegations of racist selection within a professional rugby union franchise team made by a well known former All Black and sport media personality on a popular TV sporting show. The focal actor's prominent role as a Rugby World Cup 2011 Ambassador provides a context for a consideration of stakeholder analysis in matters of risk, media and crisis management. It also provides opportunity for consideration of ethical behaviour, and a multi-level exploration of the reaction, and moral and ethical reasoning of a diverse group of political, sporting and other stakeholders.

Key words: rugby, racism, Crusaders, stakeholder analysis, ethical behaviour.

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

Rugby Union and SuperRugby

Rugby Union is a global sport played in more than 120 countries at an amateur or professional level. There are two primary versions of the game – played as 15-aside and 7-aside by men and women. The 15s version is played at school, club, provincial and international level – with a Rugby World Cup (RWC) held every four years, with qualifying tournaments played on a continental basis. The game of Rugby Sevens is also played at international level, with an annual World Series of nine two-day competitions contested by national teams playing successively at venues on five different continents. Rugby Sevens also has a World Cup held every four years, and will feature as an Olympic sport for the first time in 2016 [14b]. Rugby and the RWC attract enormous media attention, and the RWC is sport's third largest media event, following only the Summer Olympics and the FIFA World Cup.

What is now the *SuperRugby* (Super 15) competition had its genesis in 1995 when the South African Rugby Board, and New Zealand and the Australian Rugby Unions joined together to form the trans-national rugby body, **SANZAR**, that would govern and organise its new inter-country professional rugby competitions. Then known as the *Super 12*, it was the first professional international inter-provincial rugby competition. The New Zealand Rugby Union (NZRU) created five regionally-based franchises or super-teams; Australia created three and South Africa created four. The competition had an 11 game round-robin format. The early years of *SuperRugby* were dominated by two NZ teams, the Auckland *Blues* and the Canterbury *Crusaders*, until the Australian Capital Territory (ACT) *Brumbies* claimed two titles between 2001 and 2004 [16]. The *Super 12* format ended in 2005, and 2006 saw an additional Australian and South African team join the newly titled *Super 14* competition [16]. The *Crusaders* dominated once again in 2006 and 2008, but were dethroned by the South African *Bulls* side that claimed the 2007 and 2009 titles. Both the *Super 12* and *Super 14* were played using round robin formats, with teams playing relatively even home and away games. The innovative competition points system allowed teams to gain competition bonus points when scoring four tries or more; when suffering a narrow loss of seven points or less; or when a match is drawn. At the end of the regular season round-robin, the top four teams in the competition played in semi-finals. The competition points system created match excitement as teams strove to gain extra bonus points, and also tournament excitement as teams fought for a place in the playoffs during the last of the round robin games.

In November 2009, SANZAR announced the addition of the Melbourne *Rebels* for the 2011 season, expanding the competition to fifteen teams and renaming it *SuperRugby*. SANZAR also made organisational

and leadership changes in order to prepare for an extended *SuperRugby* competition played within a three *conference* format that would then generate the playoff contenders. Since the initial *Super 12* competition, the three nations had shared the responsibilities of running SANZAR (on a two-year rotation). An independent executive was seen as a key driving force for a more structured and economically viable *SuperRugby* competition. The creation of a permanent CEO role for SANZAR, rather than relying on rotated secondments from the national unions, was considered necessary, not just in the context of improving the operational delivery of the competition, but also in terms developing of *SuperRugby* as a sustainable and profitable sport business that would facilitate strategic growth across the three participating nations [3]. The 15-team format divided the nations in to three national *conferences* with teams in each *conference* playing eight home and eight away games [32] - allowing teams within a conference to play each other twice, and four out of five teams from each of the two other conferences, making a total of sixteen regular season games. The playoffs now included six teams - the winners of each conference and three teams with the next highest competition/league table points. The format guarantees each nation representation in the playoffs. The *SuperRugby* competition has been the primary vehicle for the development of professional rugby and rugby players in the three nations, providing players with a stepping-stone to their national sides. Lucrative media rights contracts are an important source of income for SANZAR, and for the three national rugby bodies, and a move to full coverage of all competition matches fuelled an increase in the value of media rights, and has also expanded viewing numbers. Indeed, increased media coverage has boosted fan interest in their teams and it is not uncommon for newspapers sporting pages to be dominated by *SuperRugby* news.

The Crusaders

All five NZ rugby franchises have a regional identity and base, their identities reflecting and encompassing exhaustive coverage of NZ's twenty six provincial unions by the five franchise teams. The *Crusaders* rugby franchise is based in Christchurch in NZ's South Island, and links to all provincial unions from Nelson at the top of the South Island through to South Canterbury. It was formed in 1996 as part of the *Super 10* competition, and has remained unchanged since [6]. The *Crusaders* have played the majority of their home games at AMI Stadium (formerly Jade Stadium) in Christchurch, although some pre-season and recent competition matches have been staged within the greater franchise catchment area, in small towns such as Timaru and Nelson. Having ended the opening campaign in last place, the *Crusaders* have since won the competition seven times, making them the most successful franchise in *SuperRugby* history [7].

According to NZRU CEO Steve Tew, who had been involved with the *Crusaders* in its infancy, one of the main ways in which their poor transition to *SuperRugby* was addressed, was through the recruitment of players from outside the franchise region. Such recruitment provided a means of counteracting an initial lack of experience within the region and within the team, and assisting the adjustment to the professional era which was foreign to all in the initial stages of the competition [8]. By the end of the first decade of the millennium *Crusaders* rugby was characterised by supporters and critics alike, as highly tactical, disciplined and structured, and a breeding ground for the development of elite players. It is widely accepted that the *Crusaders'* environment has produced some of the best and most well-known names in world rugby, including All Black captains Todd Blackadder, Reuben Thorne, and Richie McCaw, as well as two players who have been recipients of the International Rugby Board Player of the Year award, Dan Carter and Richie McCaw [14] (IRB, 2010). In 2011, McCaw became the first All Black to receive one hundred test caps.

The *Crusaders* claim that their success has not only influenced the careers of the players themselves, but that their organisation, structure, mode of operation, values etc have also been used as a blue print for success elsewhere. A disproportionate number of *Crusaders* players have been selected for the NZ All Blacks; and the *Crusaders* have seen eleven coaching staff elevated to roles with the All Blacks [9]. In addition, one former coach, Robbie Deans, who was head coach of the side which made seven *SuperRugby* finals [9], became head coach of the Australian national representative side, the Wallabies. Deans's replacement at the *Crusaders* was former *Crusaders* and All Blacks captain, and former Assistant Coach to Scotland, Todd Blackadder. The *Crusaders'* success has continued with Blackadder.

Andy Haden

Andy Haden, born on the 26th of September 1950 in the Wanganui province of New Zealand, was regarded by himself and others as something of an unconventional character in his youth. A talented rugby player, Haden represented NZ in various national age-grade teams and also the Junior All Blacks. His promise was such that he was selected for the All Blacks 1972/73 tour of the UK at the young age of twenty two. Despite high expectations, he did not play in any of the international/test matches on tour, and disillusioned with NZ rugby, moved to Tarbes in the south-west of France, to play and study [13] (Howitt, 1982). This move not only rekindled his interest, but aided his physical and technical development. On return to NZ, he continued to play for the Auckland province, and eventually achieved his test debut at age 26 against the *British Lions* in 1977. During his 41 test match career and over 100 appearances for NZ throughout the 1970s and 80s, playing as a second-row forward, Haden gained a reputation for tactical awareness, cunning and technical skill. He was regarded as a leading player of his generation, playing more than 300 first class games, recognised as the NZ Rugby Player of the Year in 1976 and 1981, and as an inspiration and leader both on and off the field – his on-field performances often the difference between a win and a loss [31].

In his playing days, Haden earned a reputation as a controversial character, often earning media attention with his views and off field actions. For example, he had always been an advocate of professional rugby and professionalism in sport, and, on this matter, continued to have an influence in the NZ rugby scene, even after his playing career finished. Indeed, he had spoken out about “shamateurism”, which according to some had “*made serial deceivers of players and administrators alike.*” In Haden’s words [36],

“I was one of those who pushed for professionalism, because I was ashamed of the deceitful and demeaning system of under-the-table payments that had developed and which I thought was unworthy of the game.”

Indeed, in 1979/80 season, Haden played club rugby for the Harlequins club in London on Saturday, and for Jaffa Algida in Italy on Sunday – hardly an existence affordable by mere amateur rugby players [13]..

“He was prepared to challenge officialdom and coaches, and force the amateurism issue, while travelling the world, eking a living out of the game.”

Later, in 1983, he made himself unavailable for an All Blacks tour of Scotland and England, in order to be able to promote his autobiography, *Boots ‘n All* (1983), sending a signal that even an All Black needed an income, and that the life of an amateur rugby player was not sustainable. His views on these matters are well-aired in his autobiographical books about his rugby career [11] [12]. Although Haden’s final game for the All Blacks was at the end of 1985 against Argentina, he established *Sporting Contacts*, an NZ-based talent agency that operates on a national and international level [30] [12] in 1982, whilst still a player. A primary focus of *Sporting Contacts* has always been to market and promote sports people, celebrities etc to business organisations, via sponsorship, endorsement and speaking engagement opportunities. *Sporting Contacts* has also developed expertise in public relations, event planning and management [30]. In addition, Haden has always been in demand as a motivational and after-dinner speaker [5], and has become a prominent media personality, sometimes used and described as a “Shock Jock”, someone prepared to speak his mind, someone not afraid to comment on matters of controversy. He regularly appears on TV and radio, for example, Sky Sport and Radio Live, as a panellist, interviewee, expert commentator etc, providing analysis, predictions and comments on rugby related and other sporting matters.

In 2003, he was diagnosed with chronic lymphocytic leukaemia and underwent successful chemotherapy treatment [20]. Continuing to live in Auckland with his wife and two adult children , he has been involved in several cancer charities: the Cancer Society, ChildCancer and the Prostate Cancer Foundation [33].

In April 2010, the RWC Minister Murray McCully unveiled the RWC NZ 2011 Ambassadors program and announced the appointment of six All Black greats to the prestigious Ambassadorial role - including Andy Haden. The NZ government initiated the program to support the promotion of NZ for the forthcoming RWC 2011 using the Ambassadors’ fame and profile [18]. One reason for Haden’s selection was to boost the tournament’s profile through his network of Australasian and Asian sporting and business leaders, and as Minister McCully said “*connecting business and tourism investment programmes up with people who can help us*” [18] [23]. Andy Haden was seemingly no longer a challenge to authority.

Racism and Rugby

Rugby Union is NZ’s national sport. Whilst its role and status in NZ society is wide-ranging and long

standing, such status can only be partially accounted for by high participation rates, fan following, match attendances, media coverage and viewing figures. According to NZ historian James Belich [2], what has ...

“... protected, entrenched and increased the dominance of ... rugby ... and magnified its importance well beyond the numbers participating was its role in collective identity” ... in society.

Accordingly, any stance taken by rugby, rugby bodies etc to various issues is considered to be a reflection of society – reflections sometimes pleasing, yet sometimes associated with disappointment, dismay or disgust. Issues related to racism and rugby have been particularly sensitive. Some have been linked with turbulent episodes, as epitomised by the 1981 tour to NZ by the South African Springboks rugby team, but also dating back to earlier All Black tours of South Africa when Maori players were deliberately excluded from selection - an action interpreted by some as reflecting a fear of offending the SA hosts, but by others as empathising with, and providing moral support for the Apartheid ideals which prevailed in SA at the time [37].

The moral authority of the NZRU was severely undermined as a result of its organisational role in, and endorsement of the 1981 tour, as many felt that rugby and rugby relations were prioritised above the fight for human rights taking place in SA. In addition, NZ had long been divided by views about sporting contact with SA, and then again, in 1981, for and against the tour. In hindsight, the 1981 tour had considerable long-lasting and negative impact negative on NZ society, in general, and rugby, in particular, as a direct result of what was yet considered by some as the continuation of a mere close sporting partnership [37] [28].

Whilst many players, including Andy Haden, chose to play during the 1981 tour, others refused to participate [27]. The NZ National Party-led government, re-affirming its “*non-interference in sport*” policy, was not only accused of doing little to prevent the Springboks from touring in NZ, but also viewed by human rights and other groups as sanctioning the political situation in SA - both views impacting adversely on the global image of NZ and the traditional values of rugby itself [37] [28]. By 1986, the new Labour Government successfully sought the acquiescence of NZRU not to tour SA. However, an unofficial tour was made by a group of NZ players known as the *Cavaliers*. Andy Haden played a significant role in organising the tour.

In the new millennium, the inter-twining of race and rugby is characterised by an ongoing debate about the emergence and growing prominence of Polynesian players in rugby at all levels, and whether or not their impact has been detrimental to the sport in an NZ context. As journalist Gregor Paul has written, “*depending who(m) you talk to, the increasing influence of Pacific Island players in NZ rugby is either the critical difference or the critical flaw*” [25, p166] – a statement that suggests the essence of latent polar views!

THE INCIDENT

The Deaker Interview

It was 26 May 2010 and Andy Haden was a guest on Sky Sport’s *Deaker on Sport* program, hosted by sport and media personality, Murray Deaker. Haden’s role as an invited panellist on the popular sporting program, was to discuss sporting topics and interview NZ sporting talent. Deaker - NZ’s number one sporting broadcaster – is prominent on radio, an acclaimed author, and widely regarded as a NZ media icon.

Just one month earlier, Haden had been announced as an official NZ Ambassador for the upcoming Rugby World Cup 2011. As one of only six retired All Blacks in the Ambassador program, Haden had been given a sought after and very privileged role. The responsibility to showcase NZ to the world, build business relationships, and attract tourism was placed on the rugby great’s shoulders [18]. During the Wednesday airing of *Deaker on Sport*, the topic turned to the *Crusaders*’ squad composition, and the “*browning of New Zealand rugby*” [31] [34]. Haden offered his views and opinions on the matter.

“Once they’ve recruited three, that’s it. That’s their ceiling. Three darkies... no more.”

The basis of his allegation was his belief that the *Crusaders* had a quota system for Polynesian players, having a set limit of three non-white players in the team at one time. Haden carried on the discussion, then saying “*In the Crusaders’ manual, there it is, it’s enshrined in their articles*” [31].

During the initial interview, host Deaker relayed Haden’s comments back to him; Haden responded by repeating and confirming them [34].

The Campbell Live Interview

Following Wednesday’s Deaker interview, Haden was in demand! He was interviewed on the Friday, 28

May, on *Campbell Live*, an early evening prime time TV current affairs show, to discuss his comments. He made it clear that he was expressing an opinion that was talked about all over the country - but not openly discussed [40]. He said that he felt the *PC nature* of the subject was stopping people from being honest about their thoughts. He also made a point that he had:

"spoken to members of the Crusaders management previous times and they had raised the subject and volunteered that they had a quota"

The perceived quota that Haden spoke of was directly related to the prevention of "browning" in rugby teams, a topic he had already spoken about at length during a 2009 interview with the NZ Herald [21].

"I think the Polynesian thing has produced a lot of young men at an early age....so they have tended to dominate secondary school rugby, so therefore the white boys are turning off the game"

He went on to say, then, that Polynesian players "play like their body type" - explosive and physical, in comparison to a more intellectual game played by "white boys". Haden made it clear that no style of play was better than the other, and one of the great fascinations of the game was the successful blending of players from different cultural backgrounds [21].

The *Campbell Live* interview continued with Haden revealing the moral support he had been given from two All Blacks and a Māori player from the *Crusaders* for expressing his comments on racial selection. When asked by the interviewer if he would apologise, Haden replied:

"Apologise for what? What would I apologise for? For having the opinion or having that discussion. Why would I apologise for that, that's unfair to apologise for something that's true" [34] [40].

In response to the use of the word "darkie", Haden said:

"What about the term "darkies"? Do you think that's appropriate these days? I had no problem being called a "honky" or a "whitey" by guys I call a "darkie", and they don't care either. Used in the right context, in jest and without any malicious intent, and that's what racism should be about, there's no malice in those sorts of things. I had a Maori from Crusaders call me up laughing his head off and agreed with everything I'd said. There you go, a Maori who's played a lot of rugby for Canterbury".

INNOCENT COMMENT TO CAUSE CELÈBRE

Following the *Deaker on Sport* interview, public and political pressure had begun to increase for the RWC Minister, Murray McCully, to front up and reprimand Haden for his comments. Pressure was also placed on Haden himself to resign from the Ambassador role. Haden disagreed, saying:

"I've always had opinions. This is just another one, no I don't think I'll be resigning" [34].

The Reaction of the *Crusaders*

Many within the broader rugby community in NZ were surprised or incredulous at Andy Haden's allegations, and those directly associated with the *Crusaders* were angered by his unwavering and continuing endorsement of the claims [15]. *Crusaders*' management and government officials felt compelled to comment in the days following Haden's comments. The Canterbury public were also asked their opinion about whether or not they believed the comments had any factual basis [1].

On the Thursday night of 27 May, *Campbell Live* reporter Carolyn Robinson explained to viewers that the show had sought an interview with Andy Haden, but that he had claimed he was busy and could not appear. Instead, the *Crusaders* and Canterbury Rugby Football Union CEO, Hamish Riach, fronted to put the franchise's perspective [4]. Riach also spoke to *RadioLive* host Maggie Barry the next day, adamant on both occasions that Haden was mistaken, labelling his comments a "...complete fabrication" and insisting that an apology was in order [26]. In Riach's interview with Barry, he stated,

"... the idea ... that there is quotas for selection, ... a systematic and planned approach to a certain number of Polynesian players in ... Canterbury Rugby or the Crusaders in any one year ... is utter rubbish".

Indeed, the *Crusaders* franchise had made a quick decision to front the media and defend the claims made in relation to their selection policies. *Crusaders* CEO Hamish Riach essentially placed the onus on Andy Haden to produce evidence, or drop the matter altogether [4]. Riach also queried Haden's ability to perform as a RWC Ambassador. Riach refused to divulge how many players of Pacific Island descent were in the *Crusaders* team, stating instead that:

"This story shouldn't be about checking the race of players of the past because that gives the story some oxygen it doesn't deserve. There is no policy" [26].

High-profile player agent Warren Alcock [15] also spoke of his close affiliation with the franchise, and asserted that he was not aware that any such issues existed, while current *Crusaders* coach Todd Blackadder expressed concern over the lasting impact of Haden's comments, by saying,

"I would really like to think that everyone knows that it is just crazy. But what irritates me the most, is that it is just absolute bloody lies. But mud sticks, you know".

Political Pressure and Haden's Response

Two days after the interview, Murray McCully and Andy Haden had an hour-long constructive discussion, mainly about the racial comment, about which the Government was most concerned. Following this, Haden made a public apology [34] for his words saying:

"... I used a term that has caused significant public comment in recent days – it was never my intention to cause offence".

In a second statement, he admitted in hindsight that obvious offence had been caused and wished to reiterate his apology. He spoke of his enjoyment in contributing to the success of the Ambassadorial program and said he *"will try to meet the challenges posed by the greater level of scrutiny associated with the role"* [23].

The Response of the Media

The media responded instantly to the issue, presenting a number of different perspectives, and seeking the opinions of those involved in *Crusaders'* management, as well as Haden himself [4]. Fairfax, the newspaper group provided specific information on the make-up of all five NZ franchises, and stated:

"The Crusaders have three Pacific Islanders and four Maori players in their current squad. In past seasons, they have had higher numbers but most years have almost always had more players than the quota number claimed by Haden" [35].

As the furore gained momentum, Government politicians, Prime Minister John Key and RWC Minister McCully were also prompted to address Haden's claims. Key expressed his belief that Haden's comments were not only *"factually incorrect, but offensive"*, while McCully insisted that he would be in contact with Haden to address the claims made and to make a decision on his future as a RWC Ambassador [35].

Similarly, politicians of other political parties weighed in on the issue. A blog posted on 31st May 2010 by Labour MP Carmel Sepuloni used the Labour Party's website to express her disapproval of the term *"darkies"* which Haden had used to describe players of Pacific Island descent. She insisted that calls for him to be dropped from his ambassadorial role were warranted [29].

The formal Labour Party response came from RWC Spokesman, Trevor Mallard who said [39]:

"Andy Haden's comments on a television sports show last night about women who accuse rugby players of rape are unacceptable and show he is not a suitable person to be an ambassador for NZ. Mr Haden may have been speaking in some misguided attempt to defend a mate but he should have known that as a person asked to represent NZ, his comments risked reflecting badly on our country. He had already upset many people with his recent comments about 'darkies' and racial quotas in rugby and should have gone then".

Similarly, on 28 May 2010, Green MP Kevin Hague was reported to have said that Andy Haden did not deserve to retain his Ambassadorial role [24], stating that:

"If you think about who we want as Ambassadors, we don't want people who will bring New Zealand into international disrepute, and that's what Andy Haden will do".

The Wider Rugby Community

NZRU Chief Executive Officer Steve Tew also expressed concerns about Haden's position as a RWC Ambassador, concerns echoing those of several rugby and government officials expressed straight after the interview [35]. Fellow RWC ambassador, and also coach of the Japan national side, John Kirwan, was one of few to express support for Haden as an individual, if not for his comments. Kirwan offered assurances to the media and the public that *"Andy's not a racist and, you know, he probably expressed himself wrongly, but he's a fantastic ambassador for our country overseas"* [38].

In addition, some members of the public appeared uncertain about whether Haden was appropriate for the role of an RWC Ambassador, citing various reasons for their concern and offering different ideas and

possible explanations for his comments. In a video compiled by Simon Baker of the New Zealand Herald, one Christchurch resident said, “... *I think it's a case of sour grapes, Auckland/Canterbury bashing as usual*”, while another suggested a skills-based approach was taken at the *Crusaders*, simply stating, “...*if they're good enough, people'll pick them*” [1].

CLOSING DOWN THE INCIDENT

Whilst others may have shared the views of *Crusaders*' CEO Riach, and whilst NZRU CEO Steve Tew and Prime Minister John Key may have commented on the issue, it seemed that the decision about Haden's future as an Ambassador for the impending tournament, was left to RWC Minister McCully [35]. Other MPs from the Maori, Labour and Green Parties were active in their disapproval of Haden's comments and made the decision to speak publicly of their dissatisfaction at the possibility of him retaining his ambassador's role [24]. However, others, such as former All Black John Kirwan had spoken out in support of Haden [38]. Minister McCully sought to talk further with Haden and clarify the situation. He then decided that Haden was too much of an asset to RWC 2011 to have his Ambassadorial status removed, whilst Haden continued to vehemently deny the need to apologise for his suggestion about the *Crusaders*' recruitment system.

EPILOGUE

Just two months after his appearance on *Deaker on Sport*, Andy Haden returned to the show and became embroiled in further controversy. Haden was asked to comment on the sex allegations made against former All Black Robin Brooke and the resulting police complaint. He expressed his opinion [39] that:

“... if the cheque bounces sometimes, they only realise that they've been raped, you know, sometimes.”

He went on to say that there are two sides to every story and *“It's an equal society now, some of these girls are targeting rugby players and they do so at their peril today, I think”*

RWC Minister McCully, disappointed to be back in a controversial situation, and knowing that Prime Minister Key was coming under pressure from “sexual abuse help groups” hinted at the outcome,

“It's the role of the Ambassadors to promote the outstanding program of activities planned for next year, not to provide a major distraction from them.”

He then said he would *“discuss something with Mr Haden quite soon.”* [35]. But at that time, Haden was unable to be contacted and was not returning his calls. However, he responded to the media and defended his statements over the following two days. He clarified that he was never suggesting women deserve their treatment by sportsmen, but that a consequence of some women seeking to attract players was putting them at risk. As disapproval surfaced and intensified in the media, on Saturday, 10 July, Haden emailed McCully, relinquishing his position as a RWC Ambassador [10], explaining that:

“to ensure that neither your leveraging initiatives, or the game of rugby that I love, are compromised by the current media backlash to the comments I had made on television recently.”

“I feel that to stay in the role, given the current media beat-up, would mean having to remove myself from making public comments on the game or related issues. I have always believed in saying what I think and I will always be true to myself in that regard and it's a sad day for society when people such as I are unable to express what we believe without a media beat-up from those with sectional interests.”

McCully stated that Haden had made it clear that he was still available to support the activities surrounding the RWC. He thanked Haden for his *“excellent contribution”* to the 2011 programme and told media he would *“most certainly look forward to receiving ... his ... valuable input”* [19].

SAMPLE CASE DISCUSSION QUESTIONS

General

Q1. Describe what makes this case situation attract so much attention?

Distinguish between the media, sporting and general public perspectives that may generate such extensive media coverage and excite debate involving the public and sporting officials.

Stakeholder Analysis

Q2a Provide a chart of **generic** stakeholders for this controversy and assess how they may have been impacted by the actions of Andy Haden and Murray Deaker.

Consider the social, cultural and economic impacts that such stakeholders may face in this case.

- Q2b Identify the stakeholder characteristics of **specific** stakeholders, such as Murray McCully (Rugby World Cup Minister) and Hamish Riach (Canterbury Rugby Football Union CEO). Provide examples of stakeholders who could be labelled as latent, dangerous or dominant stakeholders and state how such knowledge may have guided Haden's decision making.

Ethical Behaviour

- Q3 Outline the particular **chronology of ethical dilemmas** faced by Haden and later by Minister McCully, as the controversy unfolded, and the decisions that they took.
- Q4 Using Kohlberg's framework, indicate the level of **moral reasoning** exhibited by Haden and McCully for each of the dilemmas that you have identified.
- Q5 Briefly indicate how Haden and McCully could have **managed** those **situations** differently if they had recognised how the successive dilemmas may have evolved.
- Q6 What **moral values** were evident in the actions of Haden and McCully?
(Use Lumpkin, Beller and Stolle's Conceptualisation of Moral Values)
- Q7 Provide some examples of the **moral emotions** manifest in the media coverage of the Affair?

Risk, Media and Crisis Management

- Q8a. Haden publicly apologised for his comments and then eventually resigned.
Offer some reasons for why he would have done so, drawing on your analyses above.
- Q8b. What personal and business risks may Haden have faced if he had been removed from his role as a RWC 2011 Ambassador, rather than have resigned?
- Q9 Sketch out a risk analysis for Minister McCully. Suggest how your analysis may have been used to guide his decision making on the unfolding affair.

REFERENCES

- [1] Baker, S. (2010, 1). *Your views: Cantabs react to Andy Haden's comments*. 28 May 2010. Retrieved 1 Oct, 2011, from http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/video.cfm?c_id=1&gal_objectid=10648413&gallery_id=111606
- [2] Belich, J. (2001). *Paradise Reforged: A history of the New Zealanders from the 1880's to 2000* Allen Lane Penguin Press: Auckland.
- [3] Blog Spot Rugby. (2010). *SANZAR Search for CEO*. Retrieved 28 Sept 2011 from:<http://www.blogspotrugby.com/sanzar-search-for-ceo/>.
- [4] Campbell Live. (2010). *Crusaders CEO Hamish Riach talks to Campbell Live* [Online]. 27 May 2010. Retrieved October 1, 2011, from <http://www.3news.co.nz/Crusaders-CEO-Hamish-Riach-talks-to-Campbell-Live/tabid/367/articleID/157950/Default.aspx>
- [5] Captive Audience. (2011). *Andy Haden*. Retrieved 26 September, 2011 from: <http://www.captiveaudience.co.nz/speakers/andy-haden>.
- [6] CRFU. (2011a). *What's in a Name?* [Online]. Retrieved 1 October 2011, from http://www.crusaders.co.nz/content/history/Whats_in_a_name.aspx
- [7] CRFU. (2011b). *Achievements* [Online]. Retrieved 1 October 2011, from <http://www.crusaders.co.nz/content/history/Achievements.aspx>
- [8] CRFU. (2011c). *127 Years of Tradition* [Online]. Retrieved 1 October 2011, from http://www.crusaders.co.nz/content/history/127_Years.aspx
- [9] CRFU. (2011d). *Men who Shaped the Crusade* [Online]. Retrieved 1 October 2011, from http://www.crusaders.co.nz/content/history/Men_who_shaped_the_crusade.aspx
- [10] ESPN Scrum. (2010). *Rugby World Cup ambassador Haden resigns*. 10 July 2011. Retrieved 30th September, 2011 from <http://www.espnscrum.com/2011-rugby-world-cup/rugby/story/119335.htm>
- [11] Haden (1983). *Boots n All*. Rugby Press: Auckland.
- [12] Haden (1987). *Lock, Stock n Barrel*. Rugby Press: Auckland.
- [13] Howitt, B. (1982). *New Zealand Rugby Greats: Volume Two*. Auckland: Moa Publications.
- [14a] IRB. (2010). *IRB Awards: Past Winners* [Online]. Retrieved October 1, 2011, from <http://www.irb.com/history/awards/pastwinners/index.html>
- [14b] IRB. (2011). *IRB Sevens*. [Online]. Retrieved October 1, 2011, from <http://www.irbsevens.com/>
- [15] Knowler, R. (2010). *Crusaders insiders slam Andy Haden's slur* [Online]. 29 May 2010. Retrieved 2 Oct 2011, from <http://www.stuff.co.nz/sport/rugby/super-rugby/3753038/Crusaders-insiders-slam-Andy-Hadens-slur>

- [16] Melbourne Rebels. (2011). *A brief history of SuperRugby*. Retrieved 28 September, 2011, from: <http://www.melbournerebels.com.au/News/ArticleDetails/tid/270/ArticleID/1400/Default.aspx>.
- [17] McIlraith, M. (2005). *Ten Years of Super 12*. Hodder Moa: Auckland.
- [18] NZ Govt.. (2010a). *Rugby legends to be NZ 2011 ambassadors*. 27 April 2010. Retrieved 26 Sept 2011, from: <http://www.beehive.govt.nz/release/rugby-legends-be-nz-2011-ambassadors>.
- [19] NZ Govt. (2010b). *McCully accepts resignation of Andy Haden*. 10 July 2011. Retrieved 31 Sept 2011 from: <http://www.beehive.govt.nz/release/mccully-accepts-resignation-andy-haden>.
- [20] New Zealand Herald. (2003). *Rugby: Former All Black Haden fighting cancer*. Retrieved 26 Sept, 2011 from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/sport/news/article.cfm?c_id=4&objectid=3524721.
- [21] New Zealand Herald. (2010a). *Andy Haden on Polynesians and Religion* (2009). Retrieved 30 Sept, 2011 from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/video.cfm?c_id=1&gal_objectid=10648234&gallery_id=111609.
- [22] New Zealand Herald. (2010b). *Haden to keep cup role despite 'darkie' jibe*. 31 May 2010. Retrieved 30th September, 2011 from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=10648590.
- [23] New Zealand Herald. (2010c). *Haden holds on to ambassador role*. 30 May 2010. Retrieved 31st September, 2011 from: http://www.nzherald.co.nz/rugby-world-cup2011/news/article.cfm?c_id=522&objectid=10648500
- [24] Newswire. (2010). *Drop Haden as ambassador, says Green MP* [Online]. 28 May 2010. Retrieved October 1, 2011 from <http://www.guide2.co.nz/politics/news/drop-haden-as-ambassador-says-green-mp/11/16731>
- [25] Paul, G. (2009). *Black Obsession: The All Blacks' Quest for World Cup Success*. Auckland: Exisle Pub.
- [26] Radio Live. (2010). *CEO Canterbury Rugby Hamish Riach talks Andy Haden – Audio* [Online]. 28 May 2010. Retrieved September 27, 2011, from <http://www.radiolive.co.nz/CEO-Canterbury-Rugby-Hamish-Riach-talks-Andy-Haden/tid/506/articleID/13762/Default.aspx>
- [27] Reid, N. (2011). *Arresting times* [Online]. *Sunday Star Times*, 27 March 2011. Retrieved October 2, 2011, from <http://www.stuff.co.nz/sunday-star-times/features/4810616/Arresting-times>
- [28] Richards, T. (1999). *Dancing on our Bones: New Zealand, South Africa, Rugby and Racism*. Bridget Williams Publications: Wellington.
- [29] Sepuloni, C. (2010). *Andy Haden...actually - it's not ok* [Online]. Retrieved September 25, 2011, from <http://blog.labour.org.nz/index.php/2010/05/31/andy-hayden-actually-its-not-ok/comment-page-1/>
- [30] Sporting Contacts. (2011). *About us*. Retrieved 26 September, 2011 from: http://www.sportingcontacts.co.nz/About_Us_12.aspx.
- [31] Sporting-heroes.net. (2011). *Andy Haden*. Retrieved 26 September, 2011 from: <http://www.sporting-heroes.net/rugby-heroes/displayhero.asp?HeroID=6336>.
- [32] Sports Digital Media. (2010). *How will the new SuperRugby format work?*. Retrieved 28th September, 2011 from: <http://www.superxv.com/format/>.
- [33] Stuff. (2008). *Buck backs prostate fight*. 15 April 2008. Retrieved 26 September, 2011 from: <http://www.stuff.co.nz/auckland/local-news/central-leader/367720/Buck-backs-prostate-fight>.
- [34] Stuff. (2010a). *Andy Haden refuses to resign as ambassador* [Online]. 28 May 2010. Retrieved October 2, 2011, from <http://www.stuff.co.nz/sport/rugby/super-rugby/3748183/Andy-Haden-refuses-to-resign-as-ambassador>
- [35] Stuff. (2010b). *Haden to meet Sports Minister over comments* [Online]. 29 May 2010. Retrieved September 25, 2011, from <http://www.stuff.co.nz/sport/rugby/super-rugby/3753851/Haden-to-meet-Sports-Minister-over-comments>
- [36] Thomas, P. (2003). *A Whole New Ball game: Confronting the Myths and Realities of New Zealand Rugby*. Moa Publications: Auckland.
- [37] Thompson, R. (1975). *Retreat from Apartheid: New Zealand's Sporting Contacts with South Africa*. Wellington: Oxford University Press.
- [38] TVNZ. (2010a). *Maori Party tackles Haden over race claims* [Online]. 31 May 2010. Retrieved October 1, 2011, from <http://tvnz.co.nz/politics-news/maori-party-tackles-haden-over-race-claims-3574019>
- [39] TVNZ. (2010b). *Haden looking shaky as ambassador*. 9 July 2010. Retrieved 31 September, 2011 from: <http://tvnz.co.nz/national-news/haden-looking-shaky-ambassador-3636735>
- [40] TV3. (2011). *Andy Haden – Interview about Race Comments*. 28 May 2010. Retrieved 30 September, 2011 from: <http://www.3news.co.nz/Andy-Haden--interview-about-race-comments/tid/817/articleID/158120/Default.aspx>